

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

STATE OF MICHIGAN  
LIQUOR CONTROL COMMISSION  
SEMI-ANNUAL PUBLIC HEARING

Proceedings had in the above-entitled case before  
Chairman Andy Deloney and Commissioners Edward J.  
Gaffney, Dennis Olshove and Teri Quimby, held at the  
Michigan Liquor Control Commission, 525 W. Allegan  
Street, Jacquelyn A. Stewart Hearing Room, Lansing,  
Michigan, on Wednesday, December 14, 2016.

\* \* \*

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C O N T E N T S

<u>SPEAKER</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
Diane Dovico, Alliance of Coalitions for Healthy Communities	4
Michael J. Brown, Attorney, Carlin Edwards Brown	8
Janine Kravetz, Sacred Heart Rehabilitation Ctr	12
Mike Tobias, MCRUD	14
Brett Visner, MB&WWA	18
Dave Puck, MLBA	18

IN ATTENDANCE:

Greg Dunn, Atlas Sales  
Nick Goebel, Great Lakes Wine & Spirits  
A.J. Mathews, Westside Beer Distributing  
Don Nunn, Meijer  
Steve Ormond, Clark Hill  
Randy Rogers, Great Lakes Beverages  
J.R. Roskopp, Petitpren, Inc.

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE:

Anita Fawcett, Commission Assistant  
Tom Hagan, Director, Enforcement Division  
Pamela Hamilton, Deputy Director, Finance Division  
Kerry Krone, Business Manager  
April Laverty, Departmental Analyst, Executive Services Div.  
Sharon Martin, Director, Licensing Division  
Don McGehee, Assistant Attorney General's Office  
Steve Robinson, Director, Finance Division  
Lori Schrader, Executive Services Division  
Barb Subastian, Regional Supervisor, Enforcement Division  
Sara Weber, Manager, Licensing Division  
Jerry Whalen, Assistant Attorney General's Office  
Faye White, Hrgs & Appeals Supervisor, Executive Services

1                   Lansing, Michigan

2                   Wednesday, December 14, 2016 - 10:07 a.m.

3                   CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Good morning. We will call this  
4                   Semi-Annual meeting of the Liquor Control Commission to  
5                   order. This is the second of our two semi-annual public  
6                   hearings for 2016, as required by Section 215(2) of the  
7                   Michigan Liquor Control Code. This hearing is being held to  
8                   provide a public forum for airing of comments and concerns  
9                   with respect to the administration of the Liquor Control  
10                  Code. I am Andy Deloney, Chairman of the Commission, pleased  
11                  to be joined by Commissioner Ed Gaffney, Commissioner Dennis  
12                  Olshove and Commissioner Teri Quimby. Commissioner Ed  
13                  Clemente is not able to be present today. We had -- I had  
14                  asked staff a couple of weeks ago to reschedule this date  
15                  because of a conflict and unfortunately, Commissioner  
16                  Clemente already had hearings scheduled for today so he is  
17                  conducting hearings today and wishes he could attend, but is  
18                  not able to be here.

19                  This hearing is being recorded by our Reporter. So  
20                  when you come up to speak -- excuse me -- please state your  
21                  name and the organization that you represent, if any. This  
22                  will be a great help to us hearing, as well as to our  
23                  reporter. If you have specific questions or concerns you  
24                  wish to share, you may wish to reserve comment, save that for  
25                  a private conversation later on, but of course, this hearing

1 is for the public, so we will leave that to you. We have a  
2 number of cards from folks who have indicated a desire to  
3 speak today. I would ask everyone to keep their comments to  
4 no more than five minutes. We will start with -- and I will  
5 apologize if I butcher the last name, here, Diane --

6 THE WITNESS: D-o-v-i-c-o.

7 CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Thank you very much. Come on  
8 forward.

9 MS. DOVICO: Thank you very much. Do I speak into  
10 the microphone?

11 CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Yes, please.

12 MS. DOVICO: Hi. I would like to introduce myself.  
13 I am Diane Dovico. I work for a new organization called  
14 Alliance of Coalitions for Healthy Communities, but I started  
15 campaigning five years ago for a program called 21 To Buy Not  
16 Supply. There is a letter out on the table; maybe you picked  
17 it up. If not, I hope you pick it up on your way out. I  
18 want to explain this campaign. What I am here to do today is  
19 ask you if you could lend some of your time, which is very  
20 minimal, to help us broadcast this campaign to the community.  
21 So let me tell you what it is about. I represent, now, a  
22 consortium of six agencies. It is on the logo out there.  
23 They are all state agencies and Oakland County. This is a  
24 significant campaign with an approach to reduce underage  
25 drinking by reaching young adults who just turned 21. I have

1       learned that young adults who turn 21 do not realize the  
2       ramifications of providing alcohol to minors. They do not  
3       know that they can go to jail for 90 days or have a \$1,000  
4       fine. Most young 21-year olds don't have a \$1,000, nor can  
5       they afford 90 days in jail. Ninety days in jail for a young  
6       person who is in college means they lose their tuition. They  
7       can lose their scholarship and for some who have certain  
8       career choices, they have lost that opportunity for a  
9       lifetime. So the consequences are very significant. So I am  
10      asking, respectfully, that the people in the audience to help  
11      us by -- we create a lot of campaign strategies. We just did  
12      one at Wayne State University back in September. And this  
13      year, we are focusing on college students and really  
14      embracing the campaign and working with the university to get  
15      that information out to those students. What I have asked is  
16      that we have coming out to all our vendors, statewide, a  
17      window cling with a 21 To Buy logo. We are asking that you  
18      put it on your refrigerators where the point of decision to  
19      buy for minors is made or at the point of purchase. So what  
20      causes this is, you know, they are under a lot of pressure by  
21      their friends and siblings to buy for them when they turn 21.  
22      I know. I was looking forward to my friends who turned 21 to  
23      buy liquor for us -- beer, actually, for our parties and so  
24      the pressure is there. So I think some of that alleviation  
25      of pressure can be if they understand what kind of

1 consequences they can have that are life-long in their life.  
2 So although we are concentrating on college campuses --  
3 because that is our biggest target group -- we will be  
4 venturing out to all areas, a few coalitions, particularly,  
5 in Oakland County.

6 We also have five unique posters that are coming  
7 out. The most high risk drinking time for young people is  
8 welcome week at college, Halloween night, the Wednesday  
9 before Thanksgiving, St. Patrick's Day and Spring Break. So  
10 our messages align with those five times and we are going to  
11 have, you know, of course, Facebook and Twitter and all that,  
12 but Kroger now has offered -- and they just created with the  
13 Michigan State Police -- public announcements over their  
14 speaker of all 136 grocery stores for the year to make these  
15 announcements to coincide with those five times. So we have  
16 had great -- I just want to highlight those organizations.  
17 The Liquor License Control Commission actually helped us kick  
18 this off five years ago. I made a presentation in 2011 about  
19 an idea because Mike Tobias asked me to present that idea and  
20 it was someone from the Liquor License Control Commission who  
21 created a video and radio PSA and then, since then, we have  
22 brought in the Secretary of States office, the Michigan State  
23 Police, Oakland County Health Department, National Highway  
24 Safety Planning and the Alliance of Coalitions for Healthy  
25 Communities. So I really thank all of those organizations.

1       They have now gone into this idea, because this approach is  
2       different, because at least in Royal Oak -- and I was the  
3       Executive Director for a coalition -- our retailers don't  
4       sell to minors. It is like one percent of those in  
5       non-compliance or at least that are caught. So it is no  
6       longer students and young people getting it from retailers  
7       like yourself. It is getting it from their 21-year old  
8       friend and I am asking you to help us with that message. You  
9       are helping them make better decisions and you are helping  
10      reduce underage access to alcohol.

11               So with that, I thank you very much for the  
12      opportunity at least to listen to me respectfully and I am  
13      leaving for a party right now and I come from Royal Oak. So  
14      I drove all this way to say these few things. Thank you very  
15      much. Thank you very much because you guys helped this  
16      campaign just explode and I have a little letter I am going  
17      to let you -- I am going to pass out to you.

18               CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Please do. Thank you so much.  
19      Please bring it up.

20               COMMISSIONER GAFFNEY: The party is not around  
21      here, is it? If it was around here, I would crash it.

22               MS. DOVICO: No alcohol. I am not a  
23      prohibitionist. I just thought I would say that.

24               CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Thank you, Ms. Dovico, for your  
25      comments and for being present today and bringing awareness

1 not just to the issue of direct sales of alcohol to minors  
2 but a very serious other matter of third party sales to  
3 minors.

4 MS. DOVICO: Thank you very much. I appreciate  
5 that.

6 CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Next, Michael Brown.

7 MR. BROWN: Good morning, Commissioners; Michael  
8 Brown on behalf of the law firm Carlin Edwards Brown. And I  
9 am here today also on behalf of my partners, John Carlin and  
10 Scott Edwards, to primarily thank you and your staff because  
11 it has been a very busy, interesting year for us with lots of  
12 different and unique and interesting licensing issues this  
13 year and you know, we have brought many of those that are  
14 challenging situations before you and we just wanted to thank  
15 you for the time and effort that you and your staff have put  
16 in throughout the year in resolving and discussing many of  
17 those issues. We appreciate the willingness that you and  
18 your staff have to undertake those discussions because as you  
19 are obviously aware, not everything is cut and dry in  
20 interpreting the Liquor Code and in trying to figure out in  
21 today's business environment what works and what does not  
22 work. And so often times those are things we need to talk  
23 through, work through, and certainly, you and your staff have  
24 been very willing to do that this year so we appreciate that  
25 and at the risk of leaving someone out, I also wanted to take



1 a moment on this public record to thank a few people from  
2 your staff, in particular, for their efforts; people that we  
3 work with on a fairly routine basis. For example, Jill Odell  
4 who is always very prompt in responding to all of our FOIA  
5 requests. She is very good at that. David Marvin who gives  
6 us very thoughtful discussion on the very policy issues that  
7 we bring before you for discussion. Sharon Martin, Jackie  
8 Anthony, Sara Weber, again, responding to the many unique  
9 licensing issues that we have encountered this year on behalf  
10 of our clients. Rex, Rilla and Deb in your Renewal Unit.  
11 They work with us on a daily basis to allow us to pick up the  
12 hundreds of licenses that we get every year for our clients.  
13 In fact, this morning, I am picking up two more while I am  
14 here. Deb already had one of them waiting for me when I got  
15 here this morning so that is very helpful. Julie Wiles  
16 answers a lot of our insurance questions when we have them.  
17 Josh and Kyle at the front desk are always very helpful, very  
18 personable, and they help keep all of our paper moving  
19 through the system, which we file literally thousands of  
20 pages of documents here every year and they process all of it  
21 without giving us any grief, which is a testament to their  
22 character. Jane Schmitt, Terri Chase, helping us with all of  
23 our appeal issues, and lastly I would say your hearing staff  
24 -- and your court reporter, Lori -- who always help me  
25 schedule my very many violation hearings and keep that

1 process moving. So it is very helpful.

2 Lastly, I wanted to bring one issue for your  
3 consideration today and that is with respect to Senate Bill  
4 929, which, you know, just passed the Senate yesterday, has  
5 not yet been signed by the Governor, so it is not yet law,  
6 obviously, and perhaps, may not become law. We don't know  
7 what the Governor is going to do, but as you know, that bill  
8 will implement an SDM quota and approves a new system for  
9 approving SDM licenses with gas pumps. The issue I wanted to  
10 bring up is we have a client right now that has already been  
11 approved; approved a couple months ago. They are doing their  
12 build out. They are going to be ready to open very soon,  
13 perhaps, as early as next couple of weeks. So the question  
14 becomes whether or not somebody who has been approved  
15 currently, if this new law goes into effect, would they still  
16 have to have the \$250,000 worth of inventory under the  
17 current law or if we wait until, for example, after  
18 January 2, to ask you to activate that license, could we, in  
19 fact, request an amended order for approval under the new  
20 statute, again, assuming it becomes law so that therefore,  
21 they would not have to install \$250,000 worth of approved  
22 inventory. I am not asking for an answer today. Obviously,  
23 we can't really get an answer for something that is not yet  
24 law, but wanted to put that on your planning horizon for a  
25 situation that we do think is almost certain to develop here,

1 in the next couple weeks and a question that we will most  
2 likely be bringing back before you right after the first of  
3 the year. So thank you again for your time and your  
4 consideration on all these issues.

5 CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Thank you, Mr. Brown,  
6 particularly for expressing gratitude to some particular  
7 staff people. We are very blessed to have a very  
8 professional, high quality staff team. So thank you for  
9 acknowledging -- thank you for acknowledging that.

10 In regard to the new bill, yes, I just read this  
11 morning that that bill passed the House of Representatives.  
12 I am not going to call it languished, but it had been sitting  
13 there for some time. But I saw in this morning's news that  
14 it passed yesterday. There is -- staff, last week had  
15 started bringing to us some policy questions. As a matter of  
16 fact, one of the people you mentioned in your comments, Dave  
17 Marvin, sent me an e-mail with a list of some of these policy  
18 questions we are going to have to address should Senate Bill  
19 929 become enacted into law by the Governor. So there is a  
20 number of policy questions that we will have to address. The  
21 idea, speaking as one Commissioner, in my mind, is the  
22 Legislature very clearly is stating that some of these old  
23 statutory requirements in regard to gas stations with liquor  
24 licenses are going away. Certainly a current license holder  
25 or currently approved applicant can seek an amended order

1       should they feel it necessary but we had some very brief  
2       discussion last week. I know we are going to be having more  
3       as we get towards an effective date should it get signed into  
4       law but the thought in my mind is if somebody is already  
5       active, whether they have been approved for license and not  
6       active or active with a license to not hold them to the  
7       requirements of the old law just because they happen to be  
8       approved, but again, these are a number of questions that we  
9       will have to take a look at the specific language of the bill  
10      and we will have to address these types of concerns as they  
11      come forward.

12                   MR. BROWN: Great. Thank you.

13                   CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Next is Janine Kravetz.

14                   MS. KRAVETZ: Good morning. My name is Janine  
15      Kravetz; no relationship to Lenny or Gladys and I am with  
16      Sacred Heart Rehabilitation Center in Bay City, Michigan and  
17      the reason for my being here today is to express concern  
18      about some of the length of time that I see going on with  
19      alcohol compliance checks. So as I looked on your website  
20      and looked at the violation history, there were some checks  
21      that had not been done in, say, approximately 10 years. So  
22      maybe one was done in 2006; another one not done until 2016.

23                   Another concern, too, with the checks is even the  
24      length of time since some checks were done. There was one  
25      business that had not been checked since 2002 and even one

1       since January, 1986. And I would like to see the Liquor  
2       Control Commission take a look at having maybe some type of  
3       flag system where you could look at some of these and make  
4       sure that they are done more regularly than once every 30  
5       years or so. Thank you very much.

6               CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Thank you very much. Just  
7       really briefly in reply. We have a very professional  
8       investigator staff team and they are asked to do an awful lot  
9       by our Liquor Control Code. The Liquor Control Code is a  
10      document about yay thick, about this thick, and there is a  
11      lot of requirements and it seems the Legislature is adding  
12      more and more requirements for them to check all the time and  
13      I don't want to use the word distracted, but for lack of a  
14      better word, those critical health, safety, welfare issues  
15      sometimes can become a little foggy when there is all kinds  
16      of -- if you want to call it -- paperwork and reporting types  
17      of enforcement that they have to do.

18             The other thing I would say is there are a number  
19      of local law enforcement agencies in the State that do not,  
20      for whatever reason, report their findings or their  
21      enforcement checks to us. There are a lot of reasons for  
22      that. I wish more did so that we had a clearer picture.  
23      There will be times where we might get a license application  
24      and approve a license application and then get a phone call  
25      or email from an angry local law enforcement agency saying

1       how can you approve this person for a license when they  
2       failed four out of our five compliance checks? And we will  
3       say, we don't know because you didn't tell us about those  
4       things, but we have had conversation about increasing those  
5       opportunities, making sure we are -- because in my mind and I  
6       know from a lot of the Commissioners' minds -- that those are  
7       the most fundamental and the most important health, safety,  
8       welfare types of things that we can be doing. So thank you  
9       for your comments.

10               CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Next is Mike Tobias.

11               MR. TOBIAS: I will leave one for Commissioner  
12       Clemente, also. Good morning, Commissioners. My name is  
13       Mike Tobias. I am representing the Michigan Coalition to  
14       Reduce Underage Drinking. Firstly, I want to thank you as  
15       Commissioners for doing your job for the State of Michigan  
16       and I know it is a difficult job to do. I appreciate the  
17       work. I, too, have always been really pleased with the  
18       staff; you know, some of the staff I directly interact with  
19       would be: Barb Subastian, Don McGehee and some of the other  
20       AGs; Anita Fawcett, Kerry Krone, Julie Wendt, Steve Robinson.  
21       But whoever I am dealing with, the staff always does a really  
22       good job of finding answers for my questions or making sure  
23       my needs are taken care of so I appreciate that.

24               I do want to acknowledge, I believe, Teri Quimby  
25       has a new role with NABCA. I don't know exactly what it is.

1 I was trying to look it up before when I saw some kind of  
2 NABCA news. And NABCA has been very good partners over the  
3 years, too, and that is a good organization, so  
4 congratulations on that.

5 Just to, kind of, pick up where Janine mentioned  
6 the concerns. I have the same concerns as far as the length  
7 between checks and different things like that and I know it  
8 is a shared responsibility with local law enforcement, but I  
9 just want to offer the Michigan Coalition to Reduce Underage  
10 Drinking any assistance in trying to help facilitate that;  
11 maybe more coordination between local law enforcement and the  
12 Liquor Control Commission as far as maybe we could put  
13 together a statewide plan that would look at making sure all  
14 licensees get a check within so many years so you don't go 30  
15 years between checks. I believe the Michigan Association of  
16 Chiefs of Police still are very interested and willing to  
17 help on that and I have looked at the issue for a number of  
18 years and I am not sure exactly why local law enforcement  
19 don't understand or don't know about the forum to share with  
20 Liquor Control about what is going on, but again, I would  
21 encourage the Michigan Liquor Control Commission to get  
22 together with the Chiefs of Police Association and the  
23 Michigan Coalition to Reduce Underage Drinking and see if we  
24 can try and make a better system, I guess.

25 Lastly, I just want to mention the article I shared

1 with you. It is entitled, "It Is Not Just Painkillers and  
2 Heroin. Americans Have A Growing Alcohol Problem Too."  
3 There is a lot of attention on Opioids and certainly, it is a  
4 very serious problem, but it kind of talks about how since  
5 1999, the number of alcohol induced deaths, and those deaths  
6 measure direct health problems due to alcohol, and it is not  
7 including car crashes and homicides, but rather liver  
8 cirrhosis and other similar health problems have steadily  
9 increased since 1999. The article talks about 1999, fewer  
10 than 20,000 deaths and in 2015, more than 33,000 deaths. On  
11 page three, it kind of shares a few suggestions as far as  
12 what the science and research says that can help these  
13 problems and one is a higher alcohol tax; reducing the number  
14 of alcohol outlets; revoking alcohol offenders' rights to  
15 drink; put State Government in charge of selling alcohol.  
16 But the second bullet point about reducing the number of  
17 alcohol outlets, I believe -- and I think many other folks in  
18 the State of Michigan believe -- that Michigan alcohol is  
19 very available in Michigan and people are pretty satisfied  
20 with where they can get alcohol. I do see that, you know,  
21 Senate Bill 929 is pending to be approved and will open for  
22 more gas stations getting liquor licenses. I just encourage  
23 you guys, as Commissioners, to really carefully study when  
24 you are giving out licenses. Do we really need more licenses  
25 in this area? I recently saw that they are giving out



1 licenses to early retirement centers. So again, a lot of  
2 communities are struggling with too many alcohol outlets  
3 right now. So I don't understand why we continue to give out  
4 more. I appreciate your time and appreciate what you do for  
5 the State of Michigan and Happy Holidays.

6 CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Thank you very much.

7 COMMISSIONER QUIMBY: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.  
8 First of all, I just want to say thanks for coming and you  
9 always give us something in writing and I appreciate that  
10 because then I can continue to look at it long after the  
11 meeting. Some of the points that were brought up, when South  
12 Dakota came out with that sobriety program in cooperation  
13 with the police departments, that was very interesting  
14 because they were -- you know, I thought this is going to  
15 cost a lot of money and how are these police departments  
16 going to do this. They weren't the only ones doing it. I  
17 haven't followed up on that for awhile now since I was first  
18 reading those news articles about it going on, but I thought  
19 it was a very interesting program.

20 I just wanted to make a point with NABCA, I think  
21 most people may know that Chairman Deloney is the Chair Elect  
22 at NABCA, the controlled state organization which Michigan is  
23 very involved.

24 And the other national association is the National  
25 Conference of State Liquor Administrators and I am involved

1 in that. As you pointed out, I am third Vice-President now  
2 of that. Michigan is the only state where two commissioners  
3 are on executive committees, so Michigan has a very prominent  
4 role in national discussions. So thank you.

5 CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Thank you, Commissioner Quimby.  
6 Next, Brett Visner.

7 MR. VISNER: Mr. Chairman, Commissioners, Brett  
8 Visner, Michigan Beer & Wine Wholesalers Association, joined  
9 by several wholesaler members, here, today.

10 To be extremely brief, I just wanted to say thank  
11 you all for your work this year. It has been an extremely  
12 busy year and we appreciate all that you do and also want to  
13 say thank you to the staff. You have an excellent staff.  
14 They are always extremely responsive when we have questions  
15 and very helpful. So I wanted to say thank you and Happy  
16 Holidays.

17 CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Thank you, Brett. And once  
18 again, I very much appreciate the acknowledgment and  
19 appreciation for our professional staff. Thank you very  
20 much.

21 Next, Dave Puck.

22 MR. PUCK: Good morning, Chairman and  
23 Commissioners. I am Dave Puck from the Michigan Licensed  
24 Beverage Association. Scott Ellis had another appointment  
25 today so he was unable to be here, but I was sent on behalf

1 of the MLBA Board and all of our members to thank you for  
2 your continued commitment to streamlining your processes,  
3 making licensing permits, things like that, easier. It  
4 really helps and we also thank you for always being open to  
5 listen to our concerns and always being honest with us and  
6 working with us to get anything done. So Happy Holidays and  
7 thanks again.

8 CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Thank you very much, Dave. And  
9 I guess right back at you. We appreciate -- we know the role  
10 that you play at MLBA, which is training your members through  
11 the Techniques of Alcohol Management program and to all of  
12 those in the public health community, some of you are here  
13 and others who work on a daily basis to make sure that our  
14 liquor licensees are properly trained to be able to spot or  
15 to be able to make sure that they are receiving legitimate  
16 identification, to spot the signs of visible intoxication, to  
17 be on the look out for third party sales. We thank you for  
18 the work that you do on a daily basis. There are a lot of  
19 licensees who want to do the right thing and want to be in  
20 compliance with the law, but just sometimes need the tools  
21 and training to be able to do that. So we thank you for the  
22 work that you do to train them.

23 That is the last card from our guests who indicated  
24 a desire to speak. We have other cards with people who are  
25 present but not wishing to speak -- Steve Ormond with Clark

1 Hill; good morning.

2 MR. ORMOND: Good morning.

3 CHAIRMAN DELONEY: A.J. Mathews, West Side Beer  
4 Distributing; good morning; Don Nunn with Meijer; J.R.  
5 Roskopp, Petitpren, Inc.; good morning; Randy Rogers with  
6 Great Lakes Beverage; good morning; Greg Dunn, Atlas Sales  
7 and Nick Goebel, Great Lakes Wine & Spirits; good morning.  
8 Those are all the cards that we have.

9 At this time, I will invite any Commissioners -- do  
10 any commissioners have any comments they wish to make?  
11 Commissioner Olshove?

12 COMMISSIONER OLSHOVE: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I  
13 have been here for a couple years now, I guess, three or four  
14 or five, whatever it is, and I've always wondered how -- what  
15 kind of year did we have? How are we doing? When I first  
16 came in, the only real indicator of how we were doing for a  
17 given year is how Mike Brown -- what Mike Brown has to say at  
18 the end of the day. So this year, I am pretty happy. When I  
19 first came on, I was a little uncertain. Mike would come to  
20 the podium and he was downright unhappy. But the real gauge,  
21 here, is: If Mike is feeling better, then it's good.

22 So but the real thing, I want to thank -- if I had  
23 staff all stand up, everybody in the room would stand up.  
24 But collectively, as myself and I think I speak for the rest  
25 of the Commission, I appreciate all you have done for us. We

1       come from outside this environment. Ed and I -- all of us --  
2       have been connected to the Legislature in some way, shape or  
3       form and I remember -- I might be repeating myself -- but  
4       years ago and when it was a matter of getting a liquor  
5       license, it was just telling a staff person to go across the  
6       street and get one; wasn't that big of a deal; pay the money.  
7       But I certainly learned how complex the industry is and what  
8       each and every member of our staff does. So if Mike is  
9       happy, we have had a pretty good year. And I wish everybody  
10      a Happy Holiday.

11                   CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Thank you. Commissioner Quimby?

12                   COMMISSIONER QUIMBY: I just wanted to thank  
13      everybody for taking the time to come today and we value the  
14      comments that we receive. I highly suggest that everyone  
15      here and others who aren't here, continue dialogue with  
16      Chairman Deloney and the rest of the Commissioners. If we  
17      don't know about things, we can't talk about things or work  
18      on things. So your dialogue is very important and I think  
19      everyone knows that the staff at Liquor Control works very  
20      hard at trying to provide a very high level of customer  
21      service. We learned that quickly when we came on board here,  
22      that everybody really wanted to try their best to deliver  
23      that customer service and work hard to do that. We have had  
24      staff, at times, stay well past 5:00 to get a license out the  
25      door and so I want to thank staff and everybody that works

1           together in making all this stuff happen.

2                       CHAIRMAN DELONEY:   Commissioner Gaffney?

3                       COMMISSIONER GAFFNEY:   Thank you, Mr. Chair.   I  
4           have got a little perspective on things now.   I have been  
5           here almost eight years and looks like my tenure is going to  
6           be coming to an end pretty shortly.   I am just waiting to  
7           hear from the Governor's Office when they do find somebody.  
8           As you can imagine, that is going to be a hard job.   But I do  
9           find myself to be filled with gratitude for having the  
10          opportunity to be on the Commission for eight years; before  
11          that, six years in the Legislature.   I first came to work in  
12          Lansing in 1970; worked for the Legislative Service Bureau  
13          and a series of jobs leading up to today.   So it probably is  
14          time for me to retire.   I don't have the exact date, but I  
15          really had a great time while I was here and I do appreciate  
16          the people who help make my job easier -- you know, the  
17          people who prepare the dockets, like Wendy and there is  
18          another new person that does that and Faye White, Lori  
19          Schrader, Lori DeClercq, Celine Rutkowski -- they help make  
20          my job pretty easy.   I am really grateful and I have been  
21          very fortunate and blessed; for the most part, I have good  
22          health and I have been able to work until I am 72 years old;  
23          that is no mean feat.   I just want to remind everybody that  
24          as Steve Goodman said in his song, it is a mighty short trip  
25          from the cradle to the crypt so you better get it while you

1 can. Thank you. See you around.

2 CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Thank you, Commissioner Gaffney  
3 and on behalf of the Commission, we want to say thank you for  
4 all your service for the State. It is a tough job to do as  
5 was pointed out by one of our presenters. With the Liquor  
6 Control Code comes a lot of complexity. You and Commissioner  
7 Clemente, as well as the person who is going to be filling  
8 your shoes, have a tough role to do to listen to all the  
9 facts presented by law enforcement and the Attorney General  
10 and then listen to the licensee and their legal counsel and  
11 sort out that complicated Code to determine whether or not a  
12 violation took place and if so, what the appropriate  
13 punishment is. It is a complicated job. It is a difficult  
14 job. You have stepped up and played and served admirably for  
15 eight years and we wish you Godspeed and best of luck as you  
16 begin to write the next chapter of what comes next.

17 COMMISSIONER GAFFNEY: Thank you.

18 CHAIRMAN DELONEY: On behalf of the Commission, I  
19 want to present you with this Resolution.

20 COMMISSIONER GAFFNEY: Thank you. Do we have a  
21 photographer?

22 CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Hopefully not.

23 COMMISSIONER GAFFNEY: Put this in the Grosse  
24 Pointe News.

25 MR. McGEHEE: Right here, Ed.

1                   CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Yes, Assistant Attorney General  
2 Don McGehee.

3                   COMMISSIONER GAFFNEY: He wears a number of hats.  
4 This could be in the New York Times or something -- Donald  
5 Trump --

6                   MR. McGEHEE: Smile.

7                   (Pictures taken.)

8                   COMMISSIONER GAFFNEY: Thanks, Don.

9                   MR. McGEHEE: If I could concur with the  
10 Chairperson's remarks. The Assistant Attorney General's  
11 office enjoys a relationship with the Commission very much  
12 and respects every one of you, but we really had a great  
13 relationship, as we do with each of you, but particularly  
14 with Ed Gaffney. Great guy. Very fair, reasonable guy in  
15 terms of the penalties that he issues and everything like  
16 that. I enjoyed very much working with you and I wish you  
17 the best of luck, as well. We all do.

18                  COMMISSIONER GAFFNEY: You are very perceptive.  
19 Thank you.

20                  CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Appreciate that, Don. Before I  
21 make a couple of very quick closing comments, I also want to  
22 recognize our own Steve Robinson. Many of you know Steve  
23 Robinson from the Director of our Financial Management  
24 Division. Steve has given us some good and bad news. The  
25 bad news is that he is leaving us. He is -- in a few months,



1 he is going off to enjoy his own reward which is retirement.  
2 Steve has served the people of the State of Michigan at the  
3 Commission and the Auditor General for 40 -- how many years,  
4 Steve?

5 MR. ROBINSON: 39.

6 CHAIRMAN DELONEY: 39 years, almost 40 years,  
7 especially with some of the legislative debates we have been  
8 neck deep in recently. Steve, I can only tell you that we  
9 could not do what we do without having somebody who can  
10 analyze the numbers as quickly and as capably and accurately  
11 as you do. Talk about Commissioner Gaffney going to be  
12 leaving big shoes to fill, Steve, you are also going to be  
13 leaving big shoes to fill, but while it is certainly the  
14 Commission's loss, I can only say congratulations as you go  
15 off to enjoy what you have most certainly earned, which is a  
16 happy and healthy retirement. So our very best to you and  
17 thank you for everything you do for us on a daily basis.

18 And finally, I just want to wish everybody here a  
19 very Merry Christmas, the happiest of holidays and wish you  
20 all a very happy and healthy and prosperous new year of 2017.

21 As Commissioner Quimby stated, please stay in  
22 contact with us. I think there is an expectation often  
23 times -- it is a misperception -- that once somebody occupies  
24 a position such as this, whether it is an elected or an  
25 appointed position or something like this, that we have all

1 the answers. We know everything. And I can just tell you  
2 for myself, that is far from the truth. We have a very  
3 professional staff team that aids us, but we do not know  
4 there are issues out there unless we are told about them. So  
5 when you see issues and have concerns, as well as ideas,  
6 please continue to bring those forward. I would like to  
7 think that this Commission, over the last several years, has  
8 done a lot of positive things, but it is because a lot of  
9 people have come to us with a lot of ideas and we have been  
10 able to put them to good use.

11 So again, thank you for attending. Very Merry  
12 Christmas and Happy Holidays and we wish you all the best in  
13 2017.

14 With that, I will entertain a Motion to Adjourn.

15 COMMISSIONER GAFFNEY: So moved.

16 CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Moved by Commissioner Gaffney.

17 COMMISSIONER QUIMBY: Support.

18 CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Supported by Commissioner  
19 Quimby. All in favor will indicate by saying aye.

20 COMMISSIONER GAFFNEY: Aye.

21 COMMISSIONER OLSHOVE: Aye.

22 COMMISSIONER QUIMBY: Aye.

23 CHAIRMAN DELONEY: Aye. The ayes have it. We are  
24 adjourned.

25 (Hearing concluded at about 10:43 a.m.)

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

\* \* \*

I HEREBY CERTIFY that I reported stenographically,  
the foregoing testimony and proceedings on the date and place  
hereinbefore set forth; that the same was later reduced to  
typewritten form, and that the foregoing is a true, full and  
correct transcript of my stenographic notes so taken.

---

Lori K. DeClercq, CSR-3053

Dated: March 6, 2017